



Flotsam and Jetsam Number 73: December 2016

www.hockenfriends.org.nz

PEACE

Professor Kevin Clements is the Foundation Chair of Peace and Conflict Studies and Director of the New Zealand National Centre for Peace and Conflict Studies (NCPACS) at the University of Otago. On November 16th he gave a fascinating talk to a good number of Friends. When first planned the subject of the talk was slanted towards holdings within Hocken relating to peace and pacifism, with such as Archibald Baxter in mind.

However, on November 16th not too many days had elapsed since the U.S. Presidential Election, and it was obviously more appropriate for Professor Clements to speak of the tenor and substance of that campaign as it related to and might affect the prospects for world peace. The positive response of the audience clearly justified his choice of topic, and there was a lively discussion at the conclusion of his talk.

Professor Clements began, however, by reminding us that November 16th was the exact 100th anniversary of the first ballot under the Military Service Act that had passed into law in early August 1916. There were newspaper reports of the ballot system, which was managed by the Government Statistician, and of the way the results of the ballot were to be promulgated. The issue of conscription thus became a fact of life – and a disturbing one – for the people of New Zealand.

Hence the choice of subject for this issue of F&J.

WORLD WAR 1 TRANSCRIPTION PROJECT

This project is proceeding at considerable pace. At its last meeting the FOHC Committee received a summary of 31 people whose war diaries and letters have been catalogued. These include such notable Otago soldiers as Colonel Arthur Bauchop, Dr William Aitken, A.N. Haggitt, Clutha McKenzie, William Downie Stewart and Eric Miller.

Each entry includes biographical information, a description of the form of the item (diary, notebook, loose sheets), and a brief account of the scope and content (period covered, geographical setting).

58 diaries that are worth digitising have been located within the Collection, and six have so far had transcriptions completed and checked. Currently 11 are digitised and ready for transcription. The Project is also attending to a large collection of letters, running to 282 pages, which are digitised and ready for transcription. What is so encouraging is that there are now 12 active transcribers engaged in ongoing work. Responses suggest they are all happy with the Project and getting satisfaction out of their work.

2017 TALK SERIES

This has been largely finalised, and your Committee offers a wide variety of topics for your enjoyment. In this list 6 speakers are named -1 more than the programme requires. This has been done because of uncertainty over whether one topic will be ready.

Judith Bennett and Angela Wanhalla and their book Mothers' Darlings of the South Pacific: The Children of Indigenous Women and US Servicemen, World War II

Priscilla Pitts and her book (jointly with Andrea Hotere) on the Frances Hodgkins Fellowship

Nicky Page and the Dunedin City of Literature programme

Aaron Fox and his biography of James Hargest

Malcolm McKinnon and his book *The Broken Decade*, **1928-1939**, to coincide with the Annual Dinner on 2 September

Jenny Burchell and the official history of the Dunedin City Choir, celebrating its 150th anniversary

The final talk is planned to follow immediately after the FOHC Annual General Meeting.

There are 214 Friends of the Hocken Collections. Suggest to your friends that they become Friends.

THE MINISTER'S DILEMMA

When, in 1912, Massey formed a new Government he appointed James Allen as Minister of Defence. Born in South Australia in 1857, Allen arrived in New Zealand with his parents less than a year later. He was educated in England at Clifton College and then at St. John's College, Cambridge. Further education at the Royal School of Mines prepared him for mining business in New Zealand. He entered Parliament in 1887 as the member for Bruce. Always keen on military and defence matters, Allen commanded the Otago Division of the New Zealand Garrison Artillery in the Volunteer Force and was gazetted a Lieutenant-Colonel in 1902. As a member of the Opposition Allen had from its inception warmly supported the Defence Act of 1909. It was upon him that the burden fell of passing and administering the Act and its amendments, and, later, the Military Service Act. Very much the archetypal Imperialist, he firmly believed in the need for the Territorial Forces and in universal military training.

The 1912 Act defined and broadened the rights of the religious objector. With respect to detention, Allen argued that it would provide a more suitable alternative to prison and would be used primarily as a means of persuading a man to do his duty. Allen was not so singleminded that he did not see the need for reasonably broad exemption clauses for bona fide religious objectors; indeed he was always more liberal in this respect than either his fellow ministers or members of the house. Consequently the Act provided for exemption for objectors for whom 'the doctrines of his religion' forbade the bearing of arms, a provision which applied particularly to the Society of Friends. The Act also provided that objectors could apply to a magistrate for exemption and, if exempted, be free from any obligations to military service, although technically obliged to render equivalent service of a non-military nature. Allen, aware of the narrowness of the religious exemption clause, hoped the law could be interpreted loosely, and to that end he asked the Solicitor-General if it would be possible 'to so widen the clause as to make the religious objection of the individual as apart from the denomination . . . ground for exemption from military training'. However the Solicitor-General was unable to help; the Act, he said, must be interpreted as it read.

Allen's liberalism did not extend to the conscientious objector. The subject of the conscientious objector, he said, 'is so surrounded with difficulties that I cannot conceive of any legislation that could cover the matter'. It was possible, he thought, to give some definition to the religious objector, but such was not the case with the conscientious objector whose objections were purely personal and unsupportable by evidence other than that submitted by the objector himself. With a perceptive understanding of the problem, he admitted that 'once we admit that the conscientious objector has a right to be considered we shall open the door to we do not know what'.

New Zealand's anti-militarist movement was born out of opposition to the introduction of compulsory military training under the Defence Act. Its strength lay in a somewhat improbable alliance between middle-class liberalism and militant labour – its weakness was that it was a minority voice in a community where, as the crisis of the war grew more intense, majority opinion displayed a marked degree of intolerance. The 1909 Act had abolished the old Volunteer Force and incorporated its members into a proposed Territorial Force. The Defence Amendment Act of 1910, incorporated advice received from Field Marshal Kitchener during his visit to the Dominion. The first step in putting the new scheme into operation was the compulsory registration of all boys between the ages of 14 and 20.

Not all sections of the community accepted the change from a volunteer defence force to compulsory military training. The centre of hostility to the Defence Act was Christchurch. There, as early as June 1910, Louis P. Christie, editor of the *Christian Herald*, founded the Anti-Militarist League. By the end of 1911 there were sixteen Anti-Militarist Leagues throughout the country. In May 1911 Charles R. N. Mackie, a Baptist lay preacher, founded the National Peace Council. Its formation arose out of a letter from the Defence Department that had been received by every Ministers' Association in New Zealand asking churches to supply names of boys eligible for military training.

The first public anti-Defence Act meeting in New Zealand was held at the Christchurch Salvation Army barracks on 26 May. It was attended by anti-militarist sympathizers as well as members of the Socialist Party and the Anti-Militarist League. Mackie and W. Ensom undertook an organizing tour of the South - they found the clergy generally sympathetic, but 'unwilling to act'. It's worth noting that Dunedin, and Otago-Southland in general, were less favourably disposed towards the antimilitarism pro-peace campaign than anywhere else in New Zealand.

It was in Christchurch that action was taken. In February 1912 a group of young men from the Government workshops at Addington calling themselves the "We wonts" banded together under the name of the Passive Resisters Union. Other branches quickly formed in Wellington, Auckland, Millerton, and Runanga. Militant labour joined the opposition and the *Maoriland Worker*, the organ of the Federation of Labour, adopted a position strongly against compulsion. Military training, the *Worker* said, 'is conscription . . . and it means militarism'. Anti-Militarist Leagues in Runanga, Blackball, Huntly, and Waihi, all mining centres, were formed.

When National Registration was completed in July 1911, the Government instituted a series of test cases against persons alleged to have failed to register. Its view was that so long as there were recalcitrants, and there were many, the so-called Defence Act would be regarded as a failure. It chose selectively, picking on young leaders of the anti-militarist movement. Gaoling 'political' prisoners was unprecedented in New Zealand, and when it was learned that the incarcerated youths shared the same quarters as convicted criminals, there was public outrage and the Government was embarrassed.

On 9 November 1911 the National Peace and Anti-Militarist Council convened a nation-wide conference in Wellington attended by twenty-five delegates representing anti-militarist leagues, the New Zealand Federation of Labour, the Auckland Peace Society, the Society of Friends, the Women's Christian Temperance Union, and individual delegates from Auckland, Wellington, Christchurch, Huntly, Runanga, Waihi, and Hastings. The Conference decided to initiate a propaganda campaign advocating repeal of the compulsory clauses of the Defence Act - based on freedom of conscience, the traditional 'rights of Englishmen', increased burdens of taxation, interference in the education of youth, and the emphasis placed upon military power as a means to peace.

From the beginning of its operation in 1911, and intensifying in 1913, opposition to the Defence Act continued to grow. In some guarters it appeared that the Act would not succeed in its intentions. Under pressure from a well-organized antimilitarist agitation, Territorial drilling was in a shambles. The growing disenchantment with the Defence Act continued on other fronts. In Auckland, a young Quaker, Egerton Gill, founded the New Zealand Freedom League, its immediate object the repeal of the compulsory clauses of the Defence Act. In England T. C. Gregory, secretary of the Bristol Peace Federation led a virtual one man crusade against it. He published handbills and circulars under the title 'Warning to Emigrants', informing potential emigrants to New Zealand of their obligations under the Act. The Peace Council also published 'Compulsory Military Training - For Defence of New Zealand or Imperial Aggression?' arguing that the purely 'home' or 'defensive' aspects of compulsory military training were fanciful, and that compulsory training ultimately meant an army prepared to fight abroad if the Government saw the necessity for it.

One possible way out of the dilemma, so Allen hoped, was to institutionalize a programme of alternate service for religious objectors. Toward the end of 1913 Allen made two attempts to deal with this question: he asked the Quaker community to advise him in setting up a programme which would be acceptable to religious objectors, and he sent a questionnaire to all the mayors, borough, and county councillors throughout the country asking if they were prepared to provide public works projects for religious objectors. The civic bodies indicated they were unwilling to help in any way. The Quakers, adhering to their 1912 statement on alternate service, refused to define any service that 'whilst meeting the consciences of some may violate those of others.'

Throughout 1913-14 the Government continued the prosecutions. In February 1914 alone over 400 prosecutions were initiated in Canterbury. As the prosecutions mounted, it was becoming more and more evident that the Defence Act might have failed. In the year ending 30 April 1914 there were 2779 convictions of Territorials and 1367 convictions of Senior Cadets, with 234 objectors sentenced to military detention. Russell, the MP for Avon, noted he had attended parades in Christchurch and in some cases where a company should have numbered eighty, only twelve had attended. He told Allen should he take a census, in any week, 'his eyes would be opened as to what the real position is'.

It was becoming clear that public opinion was dividing on the issue. It was openly recognized that only anti-militarists were prosecuted. The movement got something of a boost when the first newspaper, and a provincial paper at that, wrote critically of the Defence Act. The *Manawatu Evening Standard* editorialized that 'amongst tax-payers, employers, and Territorials themselves, very serious doubts are entertained as to the wisdom of the expensive and disorganizing system There are signs of a revulsion of public opinion in favour of the old volunteer system.'

Whether or not the system would have broken down, and the Government forced to change, or even abolish, the compulsory provisions or the Act, is debatable. With the outbreak of the European war everything changed.



http://www.teara.govt.nz/en/photograph/32/james-allen, Alexander Turnbull Library, General Assembly Library Collection (PAColl-0838) Reference: 35mm-00177-D; F

FRIENDS OF THE HOCKEN COLLECTIONS AWARD

There was an outstanding response to the announcement of the Award. 17 applications were received, and the panel was delighted with the quality of the applications. After careful consideration they were unanimous in their recommendation to the Committee who came together on November 24th to receive their report.

The winners were Laurence Fearnley and Paul Hersey, joint editors of **On the Way to the Mountain** [the working title] – **An Anthology of New Zealand Mountaineering Writing 1830** – **2015**. Laurence is a full-time novelist, having been the Robert Burns Fellow in 2007. Her 2012 PhD, **With Axe and Rope**, examined New Zealand mountaineering literature, and she has herself climbed, skied, tramped and rock climbed in the South Island for over 45 years. Paul Hersey is also a full-time writer, photographer, fillmmaker and mountaineer, with three major works of mountaineering to his credit. What follows is a summary of their proposal.

This anthology is only the second on this subject – the previous one having appeared in 1984. They will be using material drawn from the New Zealand Alpine Club Archives held at the Hocken, as well as collections relating to known mountaineer/travellers (Dora de Beer, Bendix Hallenstein, Charles Brasch), to groups known to have ventures into the mountains (Boy Scouts), using place-name searches (Matukituki Valley, Mount Cook), and the work of writers and artists. They are 'looking for work that is vivid, entertaining, powerful, dramatic, perceptive, experimental and emotionally engaging. We want a book that captures and communicates the mountaineering experience through non-fiction, fiction and poetry.'

The anthology will cover the period from the 1830s through to the present day, and will include published and unpublished material culled from books and journals, newspaper reports and essays, short stories, poems and novels. 'It is envisaged that most work will be voice-driven, told in the first person, with the mountaineer very much present in the narrative.' It will also follow the natural order of the mountaineer – preparation and approach; camps, bivouacs and ascent; summit experience; descent; leaving and aftermath.

The anthology is to run to 250-300 pages, with two short introductory essays. Paul's will, for example, address the question of why people mountaineer. It is hoped to illustrate the key role Maori mountaineering guides played – Te Koeti Turanga of Bruce Bay in South

Westland, and Ruera te Naihi who was associated with Charlie Douglas and A.P. Harper. And there are others.

Throughout the book the main emphasis will be on nonfiction material, but with room to include fiction and poetry - something like 75% non-fiction, 25% fiction/poetry. 'The archives held by the Hocken Library contain such a rich source of material that it will comprise 60-70% of our anthology.' Both editors are based in Dunedin and are in a position to dedicate themselves fully to this project. They will, therefore, be able to systematically work their way through the New Zealand Alpine Club records, for example. Their proposal gave clear evidence that they have already located Collection holdings relating to Dorothy Theomin, Eric Miller, and James Hector, in addition to those already named. Among artists and writers they are aware of material relating to the Burton Brothers, to Jessie Mackay, Denis Glover and J.K. Baxter, and to Douglas Lilburn and Brian Brake.

The primary outcome of their successful proposal is the publication of the anthology, which already has the support of the Otago University Press. A second possibility, depending on a number of factors, is the mounting of an exhibition at the Hocken Gallery, using mountain imagery, and maps and books from the Collection. As a former curator at the Dowse Art Museum and the Robert McDougall Art Gallery, this is something to which Laurence can contribute in practical ways.

Finally it is hoped to support the launch of the anthology with a number of public presentations and lectures, which will take advantage of the long years of association both authors have had with contacts throughout the country. Within this country there are 2300 outdoor recreational clubs and societies, a 20,000strong membership of the Federated Mountain Clubs, and 4200 members of the New Zealand Alpine Club. Mountaineering literature is an international topic, and Laurence and Paul believe their project will be of interest to people well beyond the shores of this country.

FOHC MEMBERSHIP

Subscriptions: <u>Individual</u>: \$25 per annum; <u>Life Member</u> \$250 <u>Joint</u>: \$30 per annum; <u>Joint Life Member</u> \$300

Cheques to: Friends of the Hocken Collections, PO Box 6336, Dunedin North 9059.Online payment: Westpac 03 0903 0393175 000, including "Subscription" in Particulars field, surname/initials in Code and Reference fields.

Prepared by Donald Phillipps for the Friends of the Hocken Collections P.O.Box 6336, Dunedin North 9059 - <u>donaldphillipps@gmail.com</u>